

UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

Modelling and Optimisation of Personnel Scheduling Problems in Healthcare

Dr Rong Qu Computational Optimisation and Learning (COL) Group Automated Scheduling, Optimisation and Planning (ASAP) Group School of Computer Science, The University of Nottingham rong.qu@nottingham.ac.uk

Collaborators: Prof Bruker, Prof E Burke, Dr T Curtois, Dr F He, Dr J Li, Dr B McCollum, Dr G Post





Nurse Rostering in Healthcare



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

• Schedule a number of shifts to nurses in rosters, satisfying a set of constraints

- Enough number of shifts (of different types) coverage on each day during the scheduling period
- Side constraints: working/resting hours limit, complete weekends, skill levels, personal preferences, etc.
- Difficult combinatorial optimisation problem
 - Different grade and skill mixes, Number of shift types (early, day, late, night), Cover requirements can vary
 - Many constraints and objectives





UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

- Hospitals operate 24/7, introduces constraints related to night shifts and weekends
- Different grade and skill mixes
- Number of shift types (early, day, late, night)
- Cover requirements can vary

. . .

- Long scheduling horizons and large no. of employees
- Problems occur in hospital wards worldwide
- Difficult problem with many constraints and objectives
- Time consuming, frustrating and stressful problem
- Regular rescheduling required to cope with absences
- Poor planning and excess workload can cause decrease in quality of healthcare





UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA



Minimum Cover																												
E	1	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	2	2	2	1	1	1
D	2	1	1	1	2	1	1	2	1	1	1	2	1	1	2	1	1	1	2	1	1	2	1	1	1	2	1	1
<mark>DH</mark>	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
L	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
N	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1

Nurse Rostering web site at http://www.schedulingbenchmarks.org/



- Problem formulation
 - Hard constraints
 - binding, feasibility, or imperative planning rules
 - Soft constraints
 - floppy, non binding, preference planning rules
 - Weights
 - · to specify relative priorities
 - weighted sum objective function









Nurse Rostering – Literature



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

- Meta-heuristics heavily used
 - GAs, Memetic Algorithm, Tabu Search, Variable Neighbourhood Search, etc.
- Hyper-heuristics showed to be flexible and effective
- Mathematical programming also reported good results
 - Integer programming hybridised with heuristics / metaheuristics
- Others
 - Constraint programming
 - Case based reasoning, and
 - Many more

Burke E. K., De Causmaecker P., Vanden Berghe G., and Van Landeghem H. The State of the Art of Nurse Rostering. Journal of Scheduling, 7(6):441-499, Nov-Dec 2004

Nurse Rostering – Literature



5

html ×ml

- Very few benchmark nurse rostering problems
 - No typical nurse rostering problem
 - Each hospital has its own problem specific complicated objective functions and lots of constraints
- Benchmarks would help validate algorithms
 - Real-world problems collected and modelled

Cover type

- Encourage collaboration and competition



Cover is specified per shift, over and under coverage is not allowed

Other versions GPost-B.xml Same as GPost.xml but without the requests on the first two days.

Nurse Rostering web site at <u>http://www.schedulingbenchmarks.org/</u>



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

Hybrid Variable Neighbourhood Search (Hybrid VNS)



- Most meta-heuristics use only one neighbourhood operator
- Variable neighbourhood search (VNS)
 - Employ at least two neighbourhood operators
 - Theory: local optimal solutions of one neighbourhood operator might not be the local optimum of another neighborhood
 - Effective on escaping from local optimum





The University of Nottingham UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

- Hybrid VNS
- Heuristic ordering to order shifts for construction Repairing method remove worse part of roster and re-construct improvement upon rosters

Burke E. K., Curtois T. E., Post G., Qu R., and Veltman B. A Hybrid Heuristic Ordering and Variable Neighbourhood Search for the Nurse Rostering Problem. European Journal of Operational Research, 2: 330-341, 2008.





- Heuristic ordering
 - Order shifts for construction in initialisation and repair
 - More *troublesome* shifts assigned first
 - Criteria to evaluate the shifts
 - Type of shifts, number of employees able to cover it, etc.



- Variable Neighbourhood Search
 - Neighbours of a solution
 - those schedules that can be obtained by making a "move" e.g. single shifts swapped between any two nurses
 - Two neighbourhood operators
 - Assign a shift to another nurse
 - Swap shifts between nurses





UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

- Variable Depth Search
 - Form chains of moves/swaps
 - Each neighbour of the best solution: a possible starting point for the chain of moves
 - The 2nd nurse in the last move: the 1st nurse in the next move
 - New best solution: start another set of moves
 - Restart a new chain: if the chain cannot be continued for the current best solution
 - Algorithm terminates: no untried starting points of the current best solution

E.K. Burke, T. Curtois, R. Qu and G. Vanden Berghe. A Time Pre-defined Variable Depth Search for Nurse Rostering. **Journal of Heuristics**, 2007.



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA



Total Penalty 264



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA



Total Penalty 272







UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA



Total Penalty 264

More complicated to implement compared with VNS Very effective compared with previous approaches



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

HARMONYT^M

- Automated workforce management software
- Developed by ORTEC®, The Netherlands: an international consultancy company on planning, scheduling and optimisation
- − This work improved the algorithm in HARMONYTM









UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

Sequence Based Adaptive Approach

Sequences / Work Stretches





P. Brucker, E.K. Burke, T. Curtois, R. Qu. Adaptive Construction of Nurse Schedules: A Shift Sequence Based Approach. *European Journal of Operational Research*, 2008.

Sequences / Work-Stretches



• In literature

 A few work consider feasible patterns (or work-stretches) of one/two weeks, associated with pre-assigned costs

• In this work

- Problems are firstly modelled by categorising constraints into 3 types, *Sequence*, *Schedule* and *Roster* related
- Penalties of *sequences*, *schedules* and *roster* are calculated by corresponding constraints

Sequences	A series of shifts for nurses i.e. EEELL
Schedules	Ordered list of sequences and days off
Roster	Overall solution consisting of same length schedules of the scheduling period

Sequences / Work-Stretches



	Hard Constraints	Туре
1	Shifts which require certain skills can only be taken by (or assigned to) nurses who have those skills	sequence
2	The shift coverage requirements must be fulfilled	roster

	Soft Constraints	Туре
1	Minimum rest time between shifts	sequence
2	Alternative skill (if a nurse is able to cover a shift but prefers not to as it does not require his/her primary skill)	sequence
3	Maximum number of shift assignments	schedule
4	Maximum number of consecutive working days	sequence
5	Minimum number of consecutive working days	sequence

Sequence Based Adaptive Approace Nottingham

- Two stage approach
 - Construct high quality sequences for each nurse considering only *sequence* related constraints
 - Construct schedules and roster considering only *schedule* and *roster* related constraints



Sequence Based Adaptive Approace Nottingham

- Stage I: sequence construction for each nurse
 - Construct sequences by considering
 - sequence related hard constraints
 - sequence related soft constraints
 - length of up to 5
 - Best 50 are ranked

Sequences Penalty		Comment
E, E, E	0	
D, D, E, E, E	5	E not preferred to follow D.
L, L, L, D, D	5	D not allo preferred wed to follow L.
N, N	10	Two N's not preferred.
E, D, D	10	One E not preferred.



Sequence Based Adaptive Approace Nottingham



- Build schedules based on sequences for each nurse considering only *schedule* related constraints
- Iteratively combine schedules of nurses to construct rosters considering only *roster* related constraints
- Hybridise different techniques with this simple and fast approach
 - Adaptive ordering: nurses with worse schedules scheduled first
 - Greedy local search: improvement during and after roster construction





UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

Constraint Programming

Constraint Programming



- Constraint satisfaction
 - Solve problems by exploring constraints which must be satisfied by the solution
 - Set of variables taking values within domains satisfying constraints
 - Arose from AI & computer graphics in 1960s, 1970s



Constraint (Logic) Programming CLP or CP

Constraint Programming



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

- Constraint satisfaction
- Tree search

arch T	Iree
6 🔶	Choice Points: 719 🔶 Failures: 707 🔶 Solutions: 1
2	
-	
<u> </u>	
:1	
7	
2	
- 2	

 Simply model / define the problem i.e. constraints / relationship between decision variables

enum Letters {S, E, N, D, M, O, R, Y};
S E N D
+ M O R E
= M O N E Y
1000*1[S] + 100*1[E] + 10*1[N] + 1[D]
+ 1000*1[S] + 100*1[O] + 10*1[N] + 1[E]
= 10000*1[M] + 1000*1[O] + 100*1[N] + 10*1[E] + 1[Y];
};

Constraint Programming



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

• CP vs. Integer Programming

Constraints:



Decision variables:

x_{idt}	1 if employee i is assigned shift type t on day d , 0 otherwise
k_{iw}	1 if employee <i>i</i> works on weekend <i>w</i> , 0 otherwise
\mathcal{Y}_{dt}	total below the preferred cover for shift type t on day d .
Z_{dt}	total above the preferred cover for shift type t on day d .

1. An employee cannot be assigned more than one shift on a single day.

$$\sum_{t \in T} x_{idt} \le 1, \quad \forall i \in I, d \in D$$

2. Shift rotation. A minimum amount of rest is required after each shift. Therefore certain shifts cannot follow others. For example, an early shift cannot follow a late shift.

$$x_{idt} + x_{i(d+1)u} \le 1, \quad \forall i \in I, d \in \{1...h-1\}, t \in T, u \in R_t$$

T Curtois, R Qu, Computational results on new staff scheduling benchmark instances, Technical report, School of Computer Science, University of Nottingham, 2014.



- Decision variables: sij, the shift type assigned to nurse i on day j;
- CSP model which only consists of hard constraint is used to generate initial feasible solution and re-construct partial solution:
 - H1: Cardinality(*sij*, *K*, *Djk*, *Djk*),
 - H5: Cardinality(sij, Night, 0, n1),
 - H7: Stretch(sij, Night, 2, 3, P), P = (Night, Off),

- ...

HC1: daily coverage requirement of each shift type HC5: max number of *night* shifts per month HC7: min two free days after a series of *night* shifts

F. He and R. Qu. "Constraint-directed Local Search to Nurse Rostering Problems", 6th Int. Workshop on Local Search Techniques in Constraint Satisfaction CP'09, 20 Sept 2009, Lisbon, Portugal.

Nurse Rostering – Search



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA



bad region detection

Nurse Rostering – Search



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

- Large neighborhood search (LNS)
 - more general neighborhood moves performed by using a complete search solver (CP) concerning all constraints involved

Construct initial solution: solve (H) // H: set of hard constraints **While** optimal solution not found or stopping criteria not met **do** Choose the low quality fragment to be relaxed Freeze the remaining variables Re-optimize the fragment **If** found (a) First improved solution, or (b) Best improved solution Update solution **End if End while**

Nurse Rostering – Search







UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

A Decomposition Approach



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

- The main idea
 - decompose the problem into cyclic schedules for groups of nurses
 - add workload of remaining nurses
 - a VNS is then applied for further improvement

Brucker P., Qu R, Burke E.K. and Post G. A Decomposition, Construction and Post-processing Approach for a Specific Nurse Rostering Problem. **MISTA'05**, 397-406. New York, USA, Jul 2005



- The problem: derived from real-world problems in ORTEC, Netherlands
 - To create monthly schedules for wards
 - Different types of nurses (PT, FT)
 - 4 shift types and demand in a week

12 Full-time nurses	36 hours/week
1 Part-time nurse	32 hours/week
3 Part-time nurses	20 hours/week

			Demand							
Shift type	Start time	End time	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat	Sun	
Early	07:00	16:00	3	3	3	3	3	2	2	
Day	08:00	17:00	3	3	3	3	3	2	2	
Late	14:00	23:00	3	3	3	3	3	2	2	
Night	23:00	07:00	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	



- The problem: hard constraints
 - HC1: daily coverage requirement of each shift type
 - HC2: for each day, a nurse works at most one shift
 - HC3: max number of working days per month
 - HC4: max number of on-duty weekends per month
 - HC5: max number of night shifts per month
 - HC6: no *night* shift between two non-*night* shifts
 - HC7: min two free days after a series of night shifts
 - HC8: max number of consecutive *night* shifts
 - HC9: max number of consecutive working days
 - HC10: no late shifts for one particular nurse



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

• The problem: soft constraints

SC1	either no shifts or two shifts in weekends	1000
SC2	avoiding a single day between two days off	1000
SC3	length of a series of night shifts	1000
SC4	Min number of free days after a series of shifts	100
SC5	Max/Min number of consecutive assignments of a specific shift type	10
SC6	Max/Min number of weekly working days	10
SC7	Max number of consecutive working days for part-time nurses	10
SC8	avoiding certain shift type successions (e.g. a <i>day</i> shift followed by an <i>early</i> one, etc)	5



	Week 1										
	Μ	Т	W	Т	F	S	S				
Nurse 1	D	D	D			Ε	Ε				
Nurse 2	L	L	L								
Nurse 3	Ε	Ε	E	L	L						
Nurse 4				Ε	E	L	L				
Nurse 5	Ν	Ν			D	D	D				



			W	eek	1		Week 2							
	Μ	Т	W	Т	F	S	S	Μ	Т	W	Т	F	S	S
Nurse 1	D	D	D			Ε	E							
Nurse 2	L	L	L					L	L	L				
Nurse 3	Ε	E	E	L	L			E	E	Ε	L	L		
Nurse 4				Ε	E	L	L				E	E	L	L
Nurse 5	Ν	Ν			D	D	D	Ν	N			D	D	D
								D	D	D			Ε	Ε



			W	eek	1			Week 2													
	Μ	Т	W	Т	F	S	S	Μ	Т	W	Т	F	S	S							
Nurse 1	D	D	D			E	E	L	L	L											
Nurse 2	L	L	L					E	E	E	L	L									
Nurse 3	E	E	E	L	L						E	E	L	L	•••						
Nurse 4				E	E	L	L	N	N			D	D	D							
Nurse 5	N	N			D	D	D	D	D	D			E	E							
								D	D	D			E	E]						

Decomposition – Approach



m <mark>HAR</mark>	** <mark>HARMONY - [Staff schedule Tim 01-02-2003 - 01-03-2003]</mark>															_ 8																					
	neral		Main	ll n	ice i Ioeba	empic	ottiev	Plan		AI		ras į Æ		matic IIII	piann	er <u>(</u>	Jverv	1ew	Repo	III	<u>w</u> ina	ow Find	May	al				88.			~	1					
₩ 5			···· ,	•] 「		Jaru s	seccini	ys r		Z*	¥			6 23	-			_		8		FILIU	INCO		_		- <u>1</u> 2				-	•					1
an anna		201		1			1	F	e	b	r	u	a	r	Y				10000		1.22	-								-				1.			
mplox	5	5	M	T	W	T	F	5	5	м	T	W	T	F	5	5	м	T	w	T	F	5	5	м	T	W	T	F	5	5	м	T	w	T	F		Horizont
FTE	25	26	27	28	29	30	31	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28		Penalty
36:00			D	D	L	L	L					D	D	Ν	N	Ν		_		Е	Е	D	D	L	L				L	L	Е	Е	L	L			5
36:00					D	D	N	Ν	Ν		1.		Е	Е	D	D	L	L				L	L	Е	Е	L	L	-			D	D	L	L			5
36:00	N	Ν				Е	Е	D	D	L	L				L	L	Е	Е	L	L	1	-		D	D	L	L	L	8 (S)				D	D	D		5
36:00	D	D	L	L	1			L	L	Е	Е	L	L	-			D	D	L	L	L	1				D	D	Ν	Ν	Ν	1			Е	Е		5
36:00	L	L	Е	E	L	L				D	D	L	L	Ľ					D	D	Ν	Ν	Ν				Е	Е	D	D	L	L					0
36:00	L	L	Ν	Ν			D	D	D	D	D	D			Е	Е	L	L	L	1	-			Е	Е	E	L	L						E	Ε		10
36:00	D	D	D	D	D			Е	E	L	L	L					Е	Е	Е	L	L						Е	Е	L	L	Ν	Ν			D		10
36:00	E	E	L	L	L					Е	E	Е	L	L	-					Е	Е	L	L	Ν	Ν			D	D	D	D	D	D)		10
36:00			Е	E	Е	L	L						Е	Е	L	L	Ν	Ν			D	D	D	D	D	D			Е	Е	L	L	L		-		0
36:00																																					680
36:00						E	Е	L	L	Ν	N	1		D	D	D	D	D	D			Е	Е	L	L	L	-	l.			Е	Е	Е				20
36:00																																				1	680
4 ≯																																					
	-				curs.									2 2 2 4		Shifts	s to b	e plar	nned						بغريب									_		×	Violation
	E	E	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	E	Е	Е	Е	Е	E	Е	Е	E	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	Е	E	-	
	D		D	D	Е	D	D			D	D	Е	D	D			D	D	Е	D	D	D	D	D	D	Е	D	D	L	L	D	D	Е	D	D		
			L	L	D	D	D		3	L	L	D	D	D			L	L	D	D	D			L	L	D	D	D	L	L	L	L	D	D	L		
					Ν	Ν	L					L	N	L					Ν	L	L	2				Ν	Ν	L			Ν	Ν	L	L	L		
												N								N	3							1					Ν	L	L		
																				1		ő							Sc					N	N		

Decomposition – Approach



- Add the remaining shifts by using a heuristic ordering method
 - More troublesome shifts assigned first
 - Criteria to evaluate the shifts
 - Type of shifts, number of employees able to cover it, etc.

				_												_																			
Edit M	ainter	hance	Em	pļoye	e <u>P</u> l	annin	ng ⊻i	ew	⊆ards	; <u>A</u> u	toma	tic pla	Inner	Qve	ervie	w <u>R</u> e	eport	s <u>W</u> i	ndow	i -															
[:] s <u>c</u> hedu	le	-	Planb	oard	settin	gs 🕶		₽↓	V	8		E	-	De <u>f</u> a	ult du	uties	•	目		Find	d Ora	inge			۲	#4		•	۲	-					
schedule Tim 01-02-2003 - 01-03-2003																																			
						ĵ.	F	е	b	r	u	a	r	y		0						ĵ.		0						lí –		0.00			
es 🗙	5	м	т	w	T	F	5	5	м	т	w	Т	F	s	s	м	т	w	ा	F	5	s	м	т	w	т	F	s	5	м	ा	₩	Т	F	Horizon
FTE	26	27	28	29	30	31	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	Penalty
20:00					L	L					L	L	L	1		Ľ	[Ε	Е					E	E	Е	Ê		D	D		0
20:00		L	L	L							Е	Е	Е					L	L	L										Ν	N	3		Е	40
20:00						1					Е	Е	Е	88 61	Ú	22 92				L	L	L					N	N	N	3				Е	40
32:00				Е	D	D	L	L					Ν	Ν	Ν			D	D	D	L	L			Е	Е	D			L	L	D			55
36:00		Е	D	Е	E	Е			Е	Е	D	D				Е	E	D	D	D			Е	Е	L	L	L				L	L	E	E	5
36:00		N	N			D	E	Е	L	L				D	D	E	Е	E	Е				D	D	D	L	L			Е	Е	Е	-		30
36:00		L	L	L			D	D	L	L			D	L	L			E	E	E			L	L	Ν	N				-	D	L	L	N	30
36:00	-	E	E	D			_		D	D	L	L	L	2.		L	L	L	L	-		_	N	N		-	L	L	E	E	-			L	65
36:00	-	U	U	U	E	E			N	N	-	U	U	F	E	N N	N	-	-			E				D	U		L		E				5
36:00	-			N	N		-		E	E	D		L	- -		D	D	E	E	E	Ľ		-		E	E	D	D	D	D		 			5
36:00		E	E	L	L	L	-		E	E	D	D	D	<u></u>		100.00	155	1320	10000	D	D	D	D	D	D	10000	2.5-30	D	D	ī	L	N	N		10
36:00		D	Е	Е	D	D			L	L	L			D	D	D	D			N	N	N				D	Е	Е	L	L	1		D	D	25
36:00				D	D	N	N	N			Е	Е	Е			D	D	D	D			1	D	D	Е	Е	Е	1		D	D	D	D		25
36:00					Е	Е	D	D	D	D				Е	Е	L	L	N	N				Е	Е	L	L					Е	Е	E	D	0
36:00		D	D				Е	Е	D	D	N	Ν		1		Е	Е	L	L	L		1	Е	Е	D	D						Е	Е	D	0

Decomposition – Approach



| | | | | |

 |
 |

 | |
 | |

 | | |

 | | | | | | |
 | | | | | |
 | | | | | | | _ 8
 |
|--------------------------------------|--------|----------------------------|---|---
--
--
--
--
--
--
--
--
---|---|---
--
--
--
--
---|---|---
--
--
---|--|---|--
--|--|--|---|---|--
---|---|---|---|--
---|---|--|---|--|---|
| Mainte | nance | Em | pļove | e Pl | annin

 | g Vi
 | ew

 | <u>C</u> ards | s <u>A</u> u
 | itoma | tic pla

 | nner | Qve | erviev

 | ν <u>R</u> e | ports | s <u>W</u> i | ndow | í. | |
 | | | | | |
 | | | | | | |
 |
| lule | •]] | Planb | oard | settin | igs 🕶

 |
 | ₽↓

 | V | 8
 | 6 | 國

 | | De <u>f</u> a | ult du

 | ities | • | H | × | Find | Ora | nge
 | | | • | # | | •
 | ► | • | | | | |
 |
| schedule Tim 01-02-2003 - 01-03-2003 | | | | |

 |
 |

 | |
 | |

 | | |

 | | | | | | |
 | | | | | |
 | | | | | | |
 |
| | | | | | <u>)</u>

 | F
 | е

 | b | 340
 | U | a

 | r | y |

 | 0 | | | | | | <u>i</u> –
 | | | | | |
 | | lí – | | | | |
 |
| 5 | м | ा | W | Ŧ | F

 | 5
 | 5

 | м | Т
 | W | T

 | F | 5 | S

 | м | ा | W | ा | F | 5 | 5
 | м | Т | ₩ | Т | F | S
 | 5 | м | ाः | ₩ | T | F | Horizon
 |
| 26 | 27 | 28 | 29 | 30 | 31

 | 1
 | 2

 | 3 | 4
 | 5 | 6

 | 7 | 8 | 9

 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16
 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22
 | 23 | 24 | 25 | 26 | 27 | 28 | Penalty
 |
| | T | | | L | L

 |
 |

 | |
 | L | L

 | L | C. |

 | | | | | | Ε | Е
 | | | | | E | Е
 | Е | 2 | | D | D | | 0
 |
| | L | L | L | |

 |
 |

 | 1 |
 | Е | E

 | Е | |

 | | | L | L | L | |
 | | | | | |
 | | N | N | 8 | | Е | 40
 |
| | | | | |

 |
 |

 | |
 | Е | E

 | E | ŝ. |

 | 22
Q | | | | L | L | L
 | 1 | | | | N | N
 | N | | | | | Е | 40
 |
| | | | Е | D | D

 | L
 | L

 | |
 | |

 | N | Ν | N

 | | | D | D | D | L | L
 | | | Е | Е | D |
 | | L | L | D | | | 55
 |
| | Е | D | Е | Е | Е

 |
 |

 | E | Е
 | D | D

 | | 1 |

 | Е | Е | D | D | D | |
 | Е | Е | L | L | L |
 | | 1 | L | L | E | Е | 5
 |
| | N | N | | | D

 | Е
 | E

 | L | L
 | |

 | | D | D

 | Е | Е | E | Е | | |
 | D | D | D | L | L |
 | | Е | Е | Е | | | 30
 |
| | L | L | L | |

 | D
 | D

 | L | L
 | |

 | D | L | L

 | 1 | | E | Е | E | |
 | L | L | N | N | |
 | | | D | L | L | N | 30
 |
| | Е | Е | D | | 1

 |
 |

 | D | D
 | L | L

 | L | |

 | L | L | L | L | | |
 | Ν | Ν | | | L | L
 | Е | Е | | | | L | 65
 |
| | D | D | D | L | L

 | 2
 |

 | |
 | | D

 | D | L | L

 | N | N | | | E | ε | Е
 | L | L | 1 | | D | L
 | L | Е | Е | | | L | 5
 |
| | | | | E | Е

 | L
 | L

 | N | Ν
 | |

 | | Е | Е

 | L | L | | | | D | D
 | L | L | L | D | 1. |
 | | D | D | L | L | 2 | 5
 |
| | L | L | N | Ν | 1

 |
 |

 | Е | Е
 | D | L

 | L | 8 |

 | D | D | Е | Е | E | | ĺ.
 | | | Е | Е | D | D
 | D | D | | | L | L | 5
 |
| | Е | Е | L | L | L

 |
 |

 | Е | E
 | D | D

 | D | |

 | | | | | D | D | D
 | D | D | D | | | D
 | D | L | L | N | N | | 10
 |
| | D | Е | Е | D | D

 |
 |

 | L | L
 | L |

 | | D | D

 | D | D | | | N | N | Ν
 | | | | D | Е | Е
 | L | L | 8 | | D | D | 25
 |
| | | | D | D | N

 | N
 | N

 | |
 | Е | Е

 | Е | |

 | D | D | D | D | | | ji –
 | D | D | Е | Е | Е | 1
 | | D | D | D | D | | 25
 |
| | | | | Е | Е

 | D
 | D

 | D | D
 | |

 | | Е | Е

 | L | L | N | N | | |
 | Е | Е | L | L | |
 | | | Е | Е | Е | D | 0
 |
| | D | D | | | 1

 | Е
 | Е

 | D | D
 | N | N

 | | |

 | Е | Е | L | L | L | |
 | Е | Е | D | D | |
 | | | | Е | Е | D | 0
 |
| | Mainte | Maintenance
Jule Tim 01 | Maintenance Em
dule Planb
Ule Tim 01-02-
5 M T
26 27 28
6 L L
6 E D
N N
1 L
1 E E
1 D
1 L
1 L
1 E
1 E
1 D
1 D
1 D
1 D | Maintenance Employe Jule Tim Planboard Ule Tim 01-02-2003 5 M T W 26 27 28 29 L L L L E D E E N N E E D D D D L L L L E E D E D D D D D E E D D D E E D D D D | Maintenance Employee Planboard settin Jule Tim 01-02-2003 - 0 S M T W T 26 27 28 29 30 I L L L L E D E D I E D E D I L L L L I L L L E D I D D E D E I L L L L I I L L L I I I D D E E D I L L L L I I I D D D D L I I L L L L I I I D D D D D D I D E E D </td <td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Jule Tim 01-02-2003 - 01-03 5 M T W T F 26 27 28 29 30 31 Image: Construction of the setting of the</td> <td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Vieta Jule Planboard settings F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S 26 27 28 29 30 31 1 I L L L L I I I L L L I I I I L L L I I I I L L L I I I I L L L I I I I L L L I I I I L L L I I I I I L L L I<!--</td--><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Jule Planboard settings \blacksquare \blacksquare</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings ✓</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Au Jule Planboard settings Image: Cards Im</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automa dule Planboard settings Image: Cards Automa dule Tim 01-02-2003 - 01-03-2003 Image: Cards Image: Cards<td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic plate Jule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings Image: Settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic planner Automatic Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Mule Olocard Settings Image: Automatic planner S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T U L L</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic planner Over dule Planboard settings Image: Cards Automatic planner Over Ule Tim Ule-2-2003 - 01-03-2003 S M T W T F e b r u a r y S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T U L L <t< td=""><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic planner Overview Jule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Image: Marrier and Settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports sule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Image: maintenance Automatic planner Overview Reports Window tule Planboard settings Image: maintenance Image: maintenanc</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard Yew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Jule Planboard settings • 2 • • • Default duties •</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Jule Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Default duties Image: Automatic planner Image: Automatic pl</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window stule Planboard settings Image: Stule stule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planing View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window stule Planboard settings Image: stule s</td><td>Maintenance Employee Blanning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Windows Bule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings Image: Set</td><td>Maintenance Employee Banning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window tule Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Overview Reports Vindow Find Orange Image: Automatic planner Image: Automatic planner</td><td>Maintenance Employee Bannoord Second Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Sule Planboard Second Second Markenance Find Orange Find Orange Markenance Mark</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planhadis Verto Automatic Planhadis Planhadis</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planhoard settings W Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Sule Planhoard settings Image: Settings<td>Maintenance Employee Planning Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window bule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Blanning Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window bule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Blanning Yiew Gards Automatic planner Overview Beports Window Male Planboard settings Image Image</td></td></t<><td>Maintenance Employee Plannoard settings Verde Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Mell Planboard settings Planboard settings</td></td></td></td> | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Jule Tim 01-02-2003 - 01-03 5 M T W T F 26 27 28 29 30 31 Image: Construction of the setting of the | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Vieta Jule Planboard settings F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S 26 27 28 29 30 31 1 I L L L L I I I L L L I I I I L L L I I I I L L L I I I I L L L I I I I L L L I I I I L L L I I I I I L L L I </td <td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Jule Planboard settings \blacksquare \blacksquare</td> <td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings ✓</td> <td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Au Jule Planboard settings Image: Cards Im</td> <td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automa dule Planboard settings Image: Cards Automa dule Tim 01-02-2003 - 01-03-2003 Image: Cards Image: Cards<td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic plate Jule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings Image: Settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic planner Automatic Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Mule Olocard Settings Image: Automatic planner S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T U L L</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic planner Over dule Planboard settings Image: Cards Automatic planner Over Ule Tim Ule-2-2003 - 01-03-2003 S M T W T F e b r u a r y S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T U L L <t< td=""><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic planner Overview Jule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Image: Marrier and Settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports sule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Image: maintenance Automatic planner Overview Reports Window tule Planboard settings Image: maintenance Image: maintenanc</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard Yew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Jule Planboard settings • 2 • • • Default duties •</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Jule Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Default duties Image: Automatic planner Image: Automatic pl</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window stule Planboard settings Image: Stule stule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planing View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window stule Planboard settings Image: stule s</td><td>Maintenance Employee Blanning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Windows Bule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings Image: Set</td><td>Maintenance Employee Banning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window tule Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Overview Reports Vindow Find Orange Image: Automatic planner Image: Automatic planner</td><td>Maintenance Employee Bannoord Second Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Sule Planboard Second Second Markenance Find Orange Find Orange Markenance Mark</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planhadis Verto Automatic Planhadis Planhadis</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planhoard settings W Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Sule Planhoard settings Image: Settings<td>Maintenance Employee Planning Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window bule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Blanning Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window bule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Blanning Yiew Gards Automatic planner Overview Beports Window Male Planboard settings Image Image</td></td></t<><td>Maintenance Employee Plannoard settings Verde Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Mell Planboard settings Planboard settings</td></td></td> | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Jule Planboard settings \blacksquare | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings ✓ | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Au Jule Planboard settings Image: Cards Im | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automa dule Planboard settings Image: Cards Automa dule Tim 01-02-2003 - 01-03-2003 Image: Cards Image: Cards <td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic plate Jule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings Image: Settings</td> <td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic planner Automatic Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Mule Olocard Settings Image: Automatic planner S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T U L L</td> <td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic planner Over dule Planboard settings Image: Cards Automatic planner Over Ule Tim Ule-2-2003 - 01-03-2003 S M T W T F e b r u a r y S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T U L L <t< td=""><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic planner Overview Jule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Image: Marrier and Settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports sule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Image: maintenance Automatic planner Overview Reports Window tule Planboard settings Image: maintenance Image: maintenanc</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard Yew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Jule Planboard settings • 2 • • • Default duties •</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Jule Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Default duties Image: Automatic planner Image: Automatic pl</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window stule Planboard settings Image: Stule stule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planing View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window stule Planboard settings Image: stule s</td><td>Maintenance Employee Blanning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Windows Bule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings Image: Set</td><td>Maintenance Employee Banning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window tule Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Overview Reports Vindow Find Orange Image: Automatic planner Image: Automatic planner</td><td>Maintenance Employee Bannoord Second Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Sule Planboard Second Second Markenance Find Orange Find Orange Markenance Mark</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planhadis Verto Automatic Planhadis Planhadis</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planhoard settings W Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Sule Planhoard settings Image: Settings<td>Maintenance Employee Planning Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window bule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Blanning Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window bule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Blanning Yiew Gards Automatic planner Overview Beports Window Male Planboard settings Image Image</td></td></t<><td>Maintenance Employee Plannoard settings Verde Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Mell Planboard settings Planboard settings</td></td> | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic plate Jule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings Image: Settings | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic planner Automatic Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Mule Olocard Settings Image: Automatic planner S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T U L L | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic planner Over dule Planboard settings Image: Cards Automatic planner Over Ule Tim Ule-2-2003 - 01-03-2003 S M T W T F e b r u a r y S M T W T F S S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T W T F S S M T U L L <t< td=""><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic planner Overview Jule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Image: Marrier and Settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports sule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Image: maintenance Automatic planner Overview Reports Window tule Planboard settings Image: maintenance Image: maintenanc</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard Yew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Jule Planboard settings • 2 • • • Default duties •</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Jule Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Default duties Image: Automatic planner Image: Automatic pl</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window stule Planboard settings Image: Stule stule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planing View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window stule Planboard settings Image: stule s</td><td>Maintenance Employee Blanning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Windows Bule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings Image: Set</td><td>Maintenance Employee Banning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window tule Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Overview Reports Vindow Find Orange Image: Automatic planner Image: Automatic planner</td><td>Maintenance Employee Bannoord Second Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Sule Planboard Second Second Markenance Find Orange Find Orange Markenance Mark</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planhadis Verto Automatic Planhadis Planhadis</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planhoard settings W Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Sule Planhoard settings Image: Settings<td>Maintenance Employee Planning Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window bule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings</td><td>Maintenance Employee Blanning Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window bule</td><td>Maintenance Employee Blanning Yiew Gards Automatic planner Overview Beports Window Male Planboard settings Image Image</td></td></t<> <td>Maintenance Employee Plannoard settings Verde Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Mell Planboard settings Planboard settings</td> | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings View Cards Automatic planner Overview Jule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Image: Marrier and Settings | Maintenance Employee Planning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports sule | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Image: maintenance Automatic planner Overview Reports Window tule Planboard settings Image: maintenance Image: maintenanc | Maintenance Employee Planboard Yew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Jule Planboard settings • 2 • • • Default duties • | Maintenance Employee Planboard Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Jule Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Default duties Image: Automatic planner Image: Automatic pl | Maintenance Employee Planning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window stule Planboard settings Image: Stule | Maintenance Employee Planing View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window stule Planboard settings Image: stule s | Maintenance Employee Blanning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Windows Bule Planboard settings Image: Setings Image: Settings Image: Set | Maintenance Employee Banning View Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window tule Planboard settings Image: Automatic planner Overview Reports Vindow Find Orange Image: Automatic planner Image: Automatic planner | Maintenance Employee Bannoord Second Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Sule Planboard Second Second Markenance Find Orange Find Orange Markenance Mark | Maintenance Employee Planhadis Verto Automatic Planhadis Planhadis | Maintenance Employee Planhoard settings W Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Sule Planhoard settings Image: Settings <td>Maintenance Employee Planning Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window bule</td> <td>Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings</td> <td>Maintenance Employee Blanning Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window bule</td> <td>Maintenance Employee Blanning Yiew Gards Automatic planner Overview Beports Window Male Planboard settings Image Image</td> | Maintenance Employee Planning Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window bule | Maintenance Employee Planboard settings Planboard settings | Maintenance Employee Blanning Yiew Cards Automatic planner Overview Reports Window bule | Maintenance Employee Blanning Yiew Gards Automatic planner Overview Beports Window Male Planboard settings Image Image | Maintenance Employee Plannoard settings Verde Automatic planner Overview Reports Window Mell Planboard settings Planboard settings |

Other Applications



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA





Operational Planning Tool Interfacing Manufacturing Integrated Simulations with Empirical Data









Other Problem Applications



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

IEEE Computational Intelligence Society Task Force on Intelligent
 Systems in Healthcare



Other Recent Developments



- Automatic Algorithm Design
 - General search algorithm framework
 - Theory: landscape analysis
 - Machine learning: patterns of algorithm design / configurations
 - N. Pillay, R. Qu, ≪ Hyper-heuristics: Theory and Applications≫, Springer, ISBN <u>978-3-319-96514-7</u>, December, 2018
 - N. Pillay, R. Qu (ed.), Automated Design of Machine Learning and Search Algorithms, <u>Special Issue</u> at Computational Intelligence Magazine, 13(2), June 2018.
 - IEEE Computational Intelligence
 Society Task Force on Hyper-heuristics
 - IEEE Computational Intelligence Society Task Committee on Evolutionary Computation
 - «Automated Machine Learning and Search», Springer, under consideration

